



METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

Scott Haggerty, Chair
Alameda County

Adrienne J. Tissier, Vice Chair
San Mateo County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

Dean J. Chu
Cities of Santa Clara County

Dave Cortese
Association of Bay Area Governments

Chris Daly
City and County of San Francisco

Bill Dodd
Napa County and Cities

Dorene M. Giacomini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sue Lempert
Cities of San Mateo County

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Jon Rubin
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Amy Rein Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Ken Yeager
Santa Clara County

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

**MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE/
MEETING OF JULY 9, 2010
MINUTES**

ATTENDANCE

Commissioner Spering called the MTC Planning Committee meeting to order at 10:08 a.m. Planning Committee members and other Commissioners in attendance: Azumbrado, Chu, Daly, Dodd, Glover, Haggerty, Halsted, Kinsey, Lempert, Mackenzie, Rein-Worth, Rubin, Tissier, and Yeager.

CONSENT CALENDAR: Minutes of May 14, 2010

Commissioner Mackenzie moved approval, Commissioner Halsted seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

**MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE/ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE
COMMITTEE/JOINT POLICY COMMITTEE DISCUSSION: Greenhouse
Gas Target Principles, MTC Resolution No. 3970**

Commissioner Spering welcomed committee members, and asked for them to introduce themselves.

Attendees present were:

- Geoffrey Gibbs, Joint Policy Committee member
- Mark Green, Mayor, City of Union City
- Julie Pierce, Councilmember, City of Clayton
- John Gioia, Supervisor, County of Contra Costa
- Ash Kalra, Councilmember, City of San Jose
- Richard Gordon, Supervisor, County of San Mateo
- Jean Roggenkamp, Bay Area Air Quality Mgmt. District
- Henry Gardner, Exec. Director, ABAG
- Tina Thomas, Remy Thomas & Moose (for MTC legal staff)
- Mark Luce, Supervisor, County of Napa
- Mark Ross, Councilmember, City of Martinez
- Pamela Torliatt, Mayor, City of Petaluma
- Susan Adam, Supervisor, County of Marin
- Rose Jacobs Gibson, Supervisor County of San Mateo
- Jane Brunner, Councilmember, City of Oakland
- Sean Randolph, Bay Area Economic Forum

Mr. Steve Heminger presented a Power Point presentation on the Greenhouse Gas (GHG) target principles, which were included in the agenda packet.

Mr. Doug Kimsey added that one of the comments received after working with the technical committee and other stakeholders is that staff may not be aggressive enough, so staff posed three sensitivity tests: Transportation Demand Management, pricing and land use.

Mr. Heminger recommended that the Commission adopt MTC Resolution No. 3970 which includes a set of “Bay Area Principles for Establishing Regional Greenhouse Gas Reduction Targets” to help further inform ARB in its GHG target-setting deliberations between now and September 30, 2010. He noted that the principles recommend that ARB should not establish a GHG target for the Bay Area that exceeds a 7% per capita reduction for 2020 or a 10% per capita reduction for 2035. He noted that the schedule for setting the final targets is as follows: ARB target-setting workshop in Oakland will be held on July 21, 2010. MTC meeting is on July 28, 2010. ARB staff will release the proposed final targets in August 2010. MTC Planning Committee, with ABAG’s Administrative Committee and Joint Policy Committee members will meet again on September 10, 2010. MTC meeting is on September 22, 2010, and ARB will adopt the final targets on September 30, 2010.

Committee comment:

- Ms. Torliatt, Mayor, City of Petaluma, asked how the targets work with the Clean Air Plan, and what do we need to do from the Air District perspective on air quality. Ms. Roggenkamp stated that they just learned about the recommendations in terms of the targets, and will report back. Mr. Heminger also stated that there is the conformity process under federal law, which requires the RTP to reduce criteria pollutants.
- Commissioner Halsted stated that AB32 requires us to head toward GHG emission reductions 80% below 1990 levels by 2050. Mr. Heminger stated that SB375 focuses on only two dates – 2020, and 2035.
- Commissioner Mackenzie commented on the three sensitivity tests, and stated that it doesn’t show anything in terms of gross emissions if it were to go to 18% reduction range. Mr. Heminger stated that even with the sensitivity tests, we will get substantially below the current year emissions. Staff will follow up with an analysis to show what the numbers look like both in per capita and gross terms.
- Mr. Kalra, Councilmember, City of San Jose, asked why per capita emission reductions are higher in 2020 compared to 2035. Mr. Heminger stated that highway system performance will further degrade over time, resulting in higher emissions over time.
- Mr. Ross, Councilmember, City of Martinez, asked how much is the carbon tax and how is it applied? Mr. Kimsey the two were viewed interchangeably and simply represent a cost per mile driven. Mr. Ross believes that the incentives that we will need are going to have to come through carbon tax.

Public Comment

- Ms. Stephanie Reyes, Greenbelt Alliance, stated that the direction the committee is heading needs to not only reduce emissions, but also maximize social equity. She noted that a limit of 10% reduction for 2035 is too low, and urged the committee to work with ARB to continue to work on scenario development.

- Jenny Bard, American Lung Association, stated that the public health community is profoundly concerned about the public health impacts of climate change. She urged the committee to consider a higher target than 10%.
- Carl Anthony, Breakthrough Communities, stated that there needs to be a more robust regional equity analysis and a public health analysis.
- David Schonbrunn, TRANSDEF, disagreed with the claim that the current RTP is already climate friendly. He urged the committee to direct MTC staff to consider other infrastructure packages than what it has adopted in the past.
- Paul Campos, Building Industry Association, Bay Area, commented on the need to emphasize that the existing RTP and Projections 2007 & 2009 are not dismissible as “business as usual”, – they are already very aggressive smart growth scenarios, so going beyond the 7% and 10% is unwise.
- Carli Paine, Transform, stated that she does not believe that 7% – 10% represents the best that this region can do. Not enough work has been done to refine the tools that we are using to reveal how much a reduction the region is capable of.
- Andy Katz, Breathe California, urged the committee to be open to the alternative planning scenario which is a signal to the state that there is more funding needed for infrastructure to create a world-class transportation network.
- Tilly Chang, SFTA, also urged the committee to seek a higher 2035 GHG emission reduction target than 10%. She believes that MTC’s new travel model will show more GHG reductions due to pricing and land use transportation interactions. She also suggested a scenario that distributed land use growth around the inner Bay Area rather than only through the three largest cities.
- Wendy Alfsen, California Walks, urged the committee to ask staff to come back with a series of targets that shows what needs to be done by 2020, 2035, and 2050. She also urged staff to measure walking trips in terms of their carbon reduction.
- Egon Terplan, MTC Policy Advisory Council, stated that SB375 suggested that staff add job centers to the land use assumptions as one of the scenarios to look at.

After a lengthy discussion among the committee members, Commissioner Mackenzie moved that the committee refer MTC Resolution No. 3970 to the Commission for approval with Principle #6 establishing a 15% per capita reduction for 2035 as opposed to a 10%. Commissioner Lempert seconded. The motion failed.

Commissioner Tissier moved that the committee refer MTC Resolution No. 3970 to the Commission for approval and directing staff to come back to the full Commission meeting with more information that compares benefits and impacts of 10%, 12% and 15% per capita GHG reductions for 2035. The motion passed unanimously.

OTHER BUSINESS/PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. Andrew Michael, Bay Area Council, stated that the economic impact of the land use strategy is missing – it should be included as a principle.

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 12:22 p.m. The Committee's next meeting is scheduled for Friday, September 10, 2010 at 9:30 a.m. in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, CA.